



Fisheries
Transparency
Initiative

4th International Advisory Group meeting

15 June 2016, Madrid / Spain

Meeting Report

Prepared by

HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform

Date: 15 July 2016

This initiative is supported by the Islamic Republic of Mauritania.



Title	4th International Advisory Group meeting of the Fisheries Transparency Initiative
Date	Wednesday, 15 June 2016
Time	09.00 a.m. – 5.00 p.m.
Venue	Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Environment of Spain Paseo Infanta Isabel nº 1 Salón de Actos Madrid, Spain
Hosted by	Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Environment of Spain
Conducted by	HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform*
List of participants	Please refer to Appendix I
Agenda of the meeting	Please refer to Appendix II
Input¹	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preparatory Information • Recommendations by the Environmental Justice Foundation (EJF) on the FiTI Standard
Additional¹ presentations	Report by Pilot Countries: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Indonesia • Mauritania • Seychelles

***About the HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform gGmbH**

The HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform is a non-profit limited liability company; its profits are used for charitable purposes only. The organization is based in Berlin/Germany.

The HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA aims to advance democratic processes and smart governance strategies in Germany, Europe and the world, and advance cooperation between government, business and civil society while including academia and the media. Through this deliberative exchange of ideas, it helps to create a mutual understanding for sustainable democratic politics and ultimately strengthens the level of transparency, democratic participation and accountability of citizens. <http://www.governance-platform.org>

¹ Input and Additional Presentations are available on the FiTI Website (except for Seychelles as no slides are available).



WELCOME REMARKS AND ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Mr. **Peter EIGEN**, Chair of the International Advisory Group of the FiTI, opened the meeting by welcoming all participants. More than 45 representatives from governments (incl. representatives from Guinea, Indonesia, Mauritania, and the Seychelles), international organizations, companies and civil society organizations from all over the world accepted the invitation by the International FiTI Secretariat.

Mr. EIGEN thanked the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Environment of Spain for hosting the meeting.

Mr. **Andrés HERMIDA**, Secretary General of Fisheries of the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Environment, Spain, welcomed all participants – especially the representatives from the pilot implementing countries of Guinea, Indonesia, Mauritania, Senegal and the Seychelles – as well as the representatives from large-scale fisheries, small-scale fisheries and civil society organizations. He stated that the FiTI is in line with the objective of the Spanish Government to manage fisheries activities sustainably; an endeavor for which transparency is indispensable.

Mr. HERMIDA emphasized, amongst others, the importance of fisheries for Spain – also compared to other European countries. He further elaborated that with the new Common Fisheries Policy of the EU, which has at its heart the principle of transparency and accountability, the activities of European fleets can be scrutinized by civil society to verify whether they comply with the three principles which must govern all fisheries activities: environmental, economic and social sustainability.

Mr. HERMIDA expressed the hope that the 4th International Advisory Group meeting of the FiTI taking place in the facilities of the Ministry contributes to improve transparency in fisheries.

The entire speech of Mr. HERMIDA can be downloaded at “Conceptual Phase -> International Advisory Group -> Advisory Group Meeting – June 2016”

Mr. **Peter EIGEN** thanked Mr. HERMIDA for his welcome address.

Acknowledging that significant work still lies ahead in order to complete the Conceptual Phase of the FiTI by early 2017, Mr. EIGEN thanked all participants for their ongoing support and commitment to the FiTI.

Mr. EIGEN particularly highlighted the ongoing strong commitment of the Mauritanian Government – especially by the Ministry of Economy and Finance and by the Ministry of Fisheries and Maritime

Economy – for the initiative. He also thanked the representatives from the other pilot implementing countries for their countries' commitment and support to the initiative.

He also thanked representatives from civil society, small-scale and large-scale fisheries, donors and other experts for their strong commitment and engagement towards the common goal of increasing transparency and participation in fisheries.

Mr. **Abass SYLLA**, Director General, Ministry of Economy and Finance, Islamic Republic of Mauritania, thanked the Spanish Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Environment for hosting the meeting. He also thanked Mr. EIGEN for his engagement and support to the initiative. Mr. SYLLA pointed out the importance of the 4th Advisory Group meeting to advance the discussions towards defining the transparency elements of the FiTI Reports, a key step towards the elaboration of the global FiTI Standard. Mr. SYLLA reemphasized the importance of such an initiative for the development of the fisheries sector in Mauritania to sustain and create jobs as well as for food security in the country.

Mr. SYLLA highlighted the efforts made by Mauritania since the 1st International Conference of the FiTI in February 2016 to start the process of forming a FiTI National Multi-Stakeholder Group. Further, Mr. SYLLA called on other countries to join forces with Mauritania to ensure the long-term sustainability of the initiative by supporting the FiTI financially. On that aspect, Mr. SYLLA suggested a roundtable to mobilize the funds necessary to support the FiTI at the next World Bank/IMF Meeting, which will take place in October 2016.

Mr. SYLLA concluded by thanking the World Bank and the Arab Fund for Economic & Social Development for the support provided to the FiTI in Mauritania since its launch.

The entire speech of Mr. SYLLA can be downloaded at "Conceptual Phase -> International Advisory Group -> Advisory Group Meeting – June 2016"

H.E. **Álvaro Cedeño MOLINARI**, Ambassador of Costa Rica to the World Trade Organization (WTO), expressed the appreciation of the Government of Costa Rica for the work achieved by the Fisheries Transparency Initiative so far.

The Ambassador emphasized the willingness of the Government of Costa Rica, a country bounded by two major oceans, to ensure that all Costa Ricans benefit from the oceans in a sustainable, environmentally-friendly and inclusive manner.

H.E. MOLINARI expressed his concern with the current situation of marine fisheries worldwide, highlighting the need to reform global fisheries governance in ways that support sustainable

development. He emphasized in particular the importance of data collection to ensure sustainability in fisheries.

The Ambassador concluded by declaring the full commitment at the highest-level in Costa Rica to create conditions in the country to enable an open and accessible flow of relevant fisheries information.

The entire speech of Mr. MOLINARI can be downloaded at “Conceptual Phase -> International Advisory Group -> Advisory Group Meeting – June 2016”

H.E. **André LOUA**, Minister of Fisheries, Aquaculture and Maritime Economy, Republic of Guinea, opened his remarks by stating that H.E. Prof. Alpha CONDÉ, President of the Republic of Guinea, recently committed his country to start implementing the FiTI multi-stakeholder process for Guinea this year (in addition to Indonesia, Mauritania, Senegal and the Seychelles). H.E. André LOUA thanked Mr. HERMIDA for hosting this important event as well as Mr. EIGEN for extending a multi-stakeholder driven approach of transparency to the fisheries sector. The Minister maintained that Guinea strives to manage its natural resources with caution, from fisheries to extractive resources. On this aspect, H.E. André LOUA recalled that Guinea adhered to the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI), thereby showing the commitment of the country towards good natural resource governance.

The Minister emphasized the high importance of fisheries for the Guinean economy and insisted on the strong engagement of Guinea in favor of more responsible fisheries. H.E. André LOUA declared that the rapid and often uncontrolled exploitation of fisheries resources on the coast of the region is following a worrying trend, which could be detrimental for maritime resources, including those of Guinea. The Minister highlighted the various efforts of Guinea to counter this trend over the past years, notably at the legislative and surveillance level.

H.E. André LOUA also reported on the efforts of the Government of Guinea to enhance inclusiveness in the sector by including business and civil society representatives to implement the objectives set by the government, and to strengthen measures against IUU fishing in Guinean waters.

The Minister concluded by further emphasizing the importance of transparency in fisheries and the engagement of Guinea to follow the path of the FiTI.

The entire speech of H.E. Minister LOUA can be downloaded at “Conceptual Phase -> International Advisory Group -> Advisory Group Meeting – June 2016”

The proposed agenda for the meeting was adopted by all participants.

Mr. **Sven BIERMANN**, Director of the Fisheries Transparency Initiative, outlined the agenda and the major objectives of the meeting:

1. Provide an update on the **current status**;
2. Present the progress achieved by **pilot implementing countries of the FiTI: Indonesia, Mauritania and the Seychelles**;
3. Outline the current status of the discussions regarding the **process of collecting and verifying information** provided under the FiTI;
4. Discuss and agree on **recommendations on**:
 - **mandatory reporting elements for tenure arrangements, large-scale- and small-scale fisheries** -
 - **contextual information** -
 - **basic transparency requirements**; and
5. Define the **next steps** towards finalizing the Conceptual Phase (incl. 2nd International Conference of the FiTI).

Mr. BIERMANN emphasized that, based on the progress made in the preceding Advisory Group meetings, the 4th meeting should primarily be used to reach an agreement on the reporting scope of the FiTI (i.e. the transparency elements) in order to focus on the reporting process and governance of the FiTI by the end of 2016.

UPDATE: STATUS OF THE INITIATIVE

Mr. **BIERMANN** gave an update on the current status of the initiative. The three major activities since the 3rd International Advisory Group meeting in Nouakchott were to

- i) specify the reporting scope (i.e. transparency elements) of the FiTI;
- ii) develop a practical guidance note for countries intending to implement the FiTI; and
- iii) conduct outreach and communication activities.

To further define the Transparency Elements of the FiTI, the FiTI Secretariat:

- Conducted two **Feasibility Studies**;
 1. **in the Seychelles** (7-15 April 2016); and
 2. **in Mauritania** (23-27 May 2016).

The main objectives of both studies were to better understand

- i) the availability of information in the fisheries sector of a particular country (large-scale- as well as small-scale fisheries);
- ii) objections that may exist to making this information public; and
- iii) options of data gathering and verification through a multi-stakeholder process.

Mr. BIERMANN thanked again the countries for hosting these important studies and informed that both studies will be published in July 2016 on the FiTI website.

- o Conducted a **2-day Technical Workshop** in Berlin / Germany (22-23 April 2016), hosted by the FiTI International Secretariat. During the workshop, concrete recommendations on the scope of FiTI Transparency Elements) were developed on the categories of large-scale fisheries, small-scale fisheries and contextual information. Furthermore, the workshop kicked off discussions on the process of FiTI Reporting as well on the dissemination of collected information.

To assist the pilot countries implementing the FiTI, the FiTI Secretariat is currently in the process of developing a **Practical Guidance Note for countries intending to implement the FiTI**. The Guidance Note will cover the sign-up steps a country has to complete for submitting a FiTI Candidate Application. The document reflects input and recommendations from governance experts, best practices from other multi-stakeholder transparency initiatives, as well as lessons learned from recent studies.

The Guidance Note will be shared with the pilot countries for feedback in July 2016.

To further reach out to (potential) implementing countries as well as other relevant stakeholders, the FiTI Secretariat conducted a series of **outreach and communication activities**, most importantly:

- o A **country-visit to Mozambique** (16-20 February 2016) to discuss the role and importance of enhanced transparency and participation for fisheries management. For this, the International FiTI Secretariat met with H.E. Henrique BONGECE (Deputy Minister of the Sea, Inland Waters and Fisheries of Mozambique). Furthermore, the Centro de Integridade Publica (CIP) hosted a multi-stakeholder meeting at which representatives from all three major stakeholder groups – incl. large-scale- and small-scale fisheries – participated. Participants included the Ministry of Sea Inland Waters and Fisheries, Centro de Integridade Publica, OXFAM, WWF, ARMAPESCA - Associação de Armadores de Pesca, AMAPIC – Associação Mocambicana de Armadores de Pesca Industrial de Camarao, and SIP – Sociedade Industrial De Pesca).

- The **panel “From transparency to accountability: credible information supports responsible fisheries”** was conducted **at the Civil Society Policy Forum of the World Bank Group/IMF Spring Meetings** in Washington D.C. (USA) on 15 April 2016 by the International FiTI Secretariat. The panel was chaired by Peter EIGEN and featured a keynote by H.E. Jean-Paul ADAM, Minister of Finance, Trade and the Blue Economy, Republic of Seychelles.
- The International FiTI Secretariat conducted a **country-visit to Senegal** to attend, inter alia, the **6th forum of the actors of artisanal fisheries**, focused on transparency and participation in fisheries management, **organized by the APRAPAM in MBour**. The forum’s objective was to identify which information should be made public to support more transparency in fisheries in Senegal and to discuss ways to initiate the process of establishing the National Multi-Stakeholder Group in Senegal.
- The FiTI Secretariat also attended the **COMHAFAT meeting “EU partnership agreements for sustainable fishing and the good governance of the fishery in the ATLAFCO/COMHAFAT area”**, which took place in El-Jadida (Morocco) on 2-3 June 2016. The need for more transparency to support sustainable management of fisheries was highlighted in several interventions.
- Other outreach activities included meetings and conversations with the Inter-American Development Bank, Republic of Guinea (H.E. President Prof. Alpha CONDÉ), various stakeholders in Peru and Chile and with the European Commission (Commissioner Karmenu VELLA and Director General of DG MARE Mr. João Aguiar MACHADO).

Furthermore, a **partnership agreement was signed with the Sub-Regional Fisheries Commission (SRFC) for West Africa** in May 2016. The agreement covers various areas, incl. conducting joint activities to promote transparency and participation - including event participation, blogs and articles; and reaching out to member countries of the SRFC to inform them about the FiTI.

The FiTI Secretariat is also currently **in discussions with COMHAFAT** regarding a partnership agreement.

**UPDATE:
REPORTS FROM PILOT IMPLEMENTING COUNTRIES**

MAURITANIA

Mr. Mohamed Salem LOULY, FiTI Focal point at the Ministry of Fisheries and Maritime Economy, Islamic Republic of Mauritania, presented the efforts undertaken by Mauritania to the International Advisory Group.

Building up on the engagement of Mauritania since the very beginning of the FiTI, Mr. LOULY highlighted the continuous commitment of the Islamic Republic of Mauritania to the initiative. Mr. LOULY presented the activities undertaken by Mauritania since the 1st International Conference of the FiTI:

- Elaboration of a roadmap for the implementation of the FiTI (with World Bank support);
- Information and Sensitization workshops on the FiTI in Nouadhibou to reflect on the formation of a FiTI National Multi-Stakeholder Group in Mauritania and to contribute to the discussions around the elaboration of the global FiTI Standard;
- Discussions with partners to develop synergies (Inter-ministerial concertation [fisheries and finance], Zone Franche, European Union, FAO, GIZ and African Development Bank);
- Facilitation of the 2nd FiTI Feasibility Study.

Mr. LOULY also presented the next steps of Mauritania:

- Undertake a study on taxation in fisheries to identify strengths and weaknesses of monitoring of financial flows in the sector in order to comply with the FiTI;
- Undertake a study on value chain in fisheries;
- Finalize the setting-up of the FiTI National Multi-Stakeholder Group;
- Integrate the vision of the FiTI in the national and regional dashboards;
- Finalize the reform of legal texts to be in line with the FiTI Standard;
- Continue the dialogue with potential FiTI partners to develop synergies (FAO, EITI, etc.).

The presentation of Mr. LOULY can be downloaded at "Conceptual Phase -> International Advisory Group -> Advisory Group Meeting – June 2016"

SEYCHELLES

Mr. Philippe MICHAUD, Special Advisor, Ministry of Finance, Trade and the Blue Economy, Republic of Seychelles, presented the recent developments of the FiTI in the Seychelles to the International Advisory Group.

Mr. MICHAUD highlighted that the Government of the Seychelles fully supported both the 1st Feasibility Study as well as preparatory activities for FiTI implementation in the country.

Prior to the Feasibility Study, preparatory meetings with relevant stakeholders were conducted in order to raise awareness on the FiTI and proper coordination between relevant stakeholders.

Regarding preparatory activities for FiTI implementation, Mr. MICHAUD indicated that consultations have been conducted with the EITI National Multi-Stakeholder Group to discuss governance and

organizational issues. Needs to align the EITI and the FiTI National Multi-Stakeholder Groups in the Seychelles in order to ensure financial and capacity efficiency have been identified. Additionally, Mr. MICHAUD stated that the National Bureau of Statistics is fully involved in those activities and that it would be ready to assist with data collection (if needed).

Furthermore, the Seychelles are further emphasizing the link between the Blue Economy and the FiTI. For the Seychelles, the FiTI is an activity consistent with the Blue Economy strategy as it supports two fundamental principles: transparency and participation in managing marine resources.

INDONESIA

Mr. Aryo HANGGONO, Senior Expert Staff for Ecology and Marine Resources, Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, Republic of Indonesia, presented the recent developments of the FiTI in Indonesia to the International Advisory Group.

Mr. HANGGONO highlighted that after the 3rd International Advisory Group meeting in Nouakchott, Indonesia conducted three national meetings:

1. 1 March 2016: Introduction on general information of FiTI (with National Multi-Stakeholder Group Candidates)
2. 27 April 2016: Meeting to Discuss Draft of Ministerial Decree (with National Multi-Stakeholder Group Candidates)
3. 10 May 2016: Preparation of National Secretariat (involving Directorate General of Capture Fisheries, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Fisheries)

Mr. HANGGONO explained that the Draft Ministerial Decree 'Transparency Team on Captured Fisheries Management' covers the organizational structure of implementing the FiTI in Indonesia: 1) the Steering Committee; 2) an Implementing Committee and 3) a National Secretariat.

Regarding the next steps, Mr. HANGGONO stated that the Ministerial Decree of the Transparency Team on Capture Fisheries Management (the National Multi-Stakeholder Group) would be signed. Furthermore, he added that a National Secretariat under the Directorate General of Capture Fisheries of the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries would be established.

He explained that Indonesia would assess the Transparency Elements of the FiTI in order to align with existing national reporting systems.

He further explained that Indonesia is supporting in principle the idea of Regional FiTI Secretariats and is in principle interested in hosting such a regional support function. However, any decision would depend on further clarifications on regional boundaries and funding.

The presentation of Mr. HANGGONO can be downloaded at "Conceptual Phase -> International Advisory Group -> Advisory Group Meeting – June 2016"

Mr. EIGEN thanked all country representatives and acknowledged the **significant progress made by the pilot countries** despite the fact that the FiTI's governance structures and processes are not yet fully defined. He pointed out that **established structures should be flexible** enough to adapt to the evolving international requirements which will be codified in the global FiTI Standard which apply to all FiTI countries alike.

RECOMMENDATIONS ON MANDATORY REPORTING ELEMENTS FOR TENURE ARRANGEMENTS, LARGE-SCALE- AND SMALL-SCALE FISHERIES

Mr. BIERMANN started the session outlining the **basic considerations on the process of FiTI Reporting** – i.e. how information can be collected and verified. Mr. BIERMANN highlighted that while no specific recommendations will be discussed during this meeting, the discussion on Transparency Elements would benefit from a basic understanding of how the FiTI Reporting process is envisioned.

For this purpose, Mr. BIERMANN outlined that the FiTI Reporting is based on the principle that the benefits of transparency are increased when published information are perceived as **credible**. A key feature of the FiTI Reporting is therefore its provision and verification based on **multi-stakeholder participation**, involving government, companies and civil society organizations.

He further emphasized that the design of the FiTI Reporting process needs to **balance the need for providing reliable information with considerations of cost and resource availability**. Mr. BIERMANN stated that there was consensus during the Technical workshop in Berlin that a “lighter” reporting process should be established for the FiTI compared to other transparency initiatives (such as the EITI). One aspect discussed was that the reporting process may not be based on a simultaneous double reporting approach (as is the case under the EITI), but rather on an approach where the government initiates the inter-agency data provision and subsequently provides information to companies and civil society, who are then asked to either confirm or modify afterwards. Furthermore, it was acknowledged during the Berlin workshop that the process of the FiTI should clearly emphasize its multi-stakeholder nature. It was further emphasized that the National Multi-Stakeholder Group should have an active and leading role within the process and should not be seen solely as the instance of approving information.

Mr. BIERMANN further presented the idea of a **regional approach** to support information collection. Such an approach may not only be favorable with regards to cost implications and coordinating purposes, it may also increase the overall quality of the information, as countries within the same region may deal with similar challenges on data collection and verification; potentially even with the same rights holders, operators and vessels. On the other hand, such an approach has to be mindful

of potential lack of ownership by individual countries and of the fact that each country would nevertheless need its own dedicated country manager (with the relevant network within the country).

The participants acknowledged the potential of a regional approach. At the same time concerns were expressed regarding the practicality of data collection of government-owned information by a regional entity. Some participants voiced the concern that such a process would be too dependent on regional cooperation and be difficult to achieve in specific cases. Another concern was that this process could lead to a possible lack of ownership of countries.

It was pointed out that the process of FiTI Reporting should i) not duplicate data; ii) not verify already-audited data; and that iii) the body coordinating the data collection needs to be independent.

Additionally, it was highlighted that the role of Regional Fisheries Management Organizations (RFMOs) should be clarified in terms of their potential for supplying and verifying information.

It was recommended that further in-depth discussions need to be conducted by the International Secretariat to provide a recommendation on this approach to the International FiTI Advisory Group. This topic should be discussed during the 5th International Advisory Group meeting.

Mr. BIERMANN explained that the recommendations **on the mandatory reporting elements** were the main outcome of the work conducted by the FiTI Secretariat and the members of the two Working Groups (i.e. Small-Scale Fisheries and Large-Scale Fisheries). Mr. BIERMANN highlighted that these outcomes were built on the provisional list of mandatory reporting elements, discussed during the 3rd meeting of the FiTI International Advisory Group. The different activities conducted included:

- 1st FiTI Feasibility Study (7-15 April 2016, Seychelles),
- 2-Day Technical Workshop (22-23 April 2016, Berlin/Germany),
- Additional input from members of the Working Groups on Small-Scale Fisheries and Large Scale-Fisheries, and
- 2nd FiTI Feasibility Study (23-27 May 2016, Mauritania).

The recommendations focus primarily on the scope of the FiTI Reporting, and are grouped into four main components: Tenure Arrangements, Large-Scale Fisheries, Small-Scale Fisheries and Contextual Information.

Reporting Scope (DRAFT)				
	Access to marine fisheries			Other sectoral information
Components	TENURE ARRANGEMENTS <ul style="list-style-type: none"> National fishing authorizations International access agreements 	LARGE-SCALE FISHERIES <p>Per vessel:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Authorization(s) Actual Payments Actual Catches 	SMALL-SCALE FISHERIES <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of vessels Number of fishers <ul style="list-style-type: none"> per gear type according to area Total fishers 	CONTEXTUAL INFORMATION <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Post-harvest and trade data Fish-stock assessments Subsidies, etc.
Type				
Frequency	Every 12 months	Every 12 months	Every 12 months	Every 24 months

For the purpose of discussing and assessing the recommendations, Mr. BIERMANN reminded the group that it was agreed during the 3rd International Advisory Group meeting that transparency elements should be useful and relevant, practical, affordable and flexible.

Background information on each of the following recommendations can be found in the Preparatory document (date 7 June 2016): *“Conceptual Phase -> International Advisory Group -> Advisory Group Meeting – June 2016*

RECOMMENDATIONS on TENURE ARRANGEMENTS

Mr. BIERMANN explained that the component Tenure Arrangements was introduced in order to cover information that would provide the necessary framework for presenting the statistical data on the activities of large-scale- and small-scale fishing.

Recommendation 1: **FiTI Reporting should include up-to-date information regarding the country’s tenure arrangements for marine fisheries covering both national laws and international agreements.**

→ *This recommendation was approved by consensus.*

Additional remarks:

- It was agreed to cover existing fisheries access agreements as well as their protocols.

- It was also agreed that this part should include information on informal rights, including information to show how countries promote and protect those rights.
- It was agreed that all existing information on tenure arrangements should be made public. However, if a reporting category does not apply for a specific country context, countries are not obliged to report. For the purpose of clarification, it was agreed to use the term “if applicable” in the Transparency Element concerned.
- It was agreed that information on tenure arrangements should include information on whether the parliament, civil society and small-scale fisheries associations have been consulted during the negotiation of access agreements process, incl. their role in the decision-making process.
- It was welcomed that the rules allowing for ‘charter arrangements’ are included in the explanation of tenure arrangements.

Recommendation 2: Information for tenure arrangements should be provided every 12 months, complementing information on large-scale- and small-scale fisheries.

→ *This recommendation was approved by consensus.*

RECOMMENDATIONS on LARGE-SCALE FISHERIES²

Recommendation 3: In addition to large-scale fisheries information regarding their access to marine fisheries within a state’s own EEZ (and territorial waters), FiTI transparency elements should include information on the fleet of nationally flagged vessels operating in a third country or high seas.

→ *The recommendation was approved by consensus.*

Additional remarks:

- The last sentence in the initial recommendation (dated 7 June 2016) “Information on ownership (rights holder and vessel owner), vessel

² For detailed background to the recommendations, please refer to the Preparation Document, available at the FiTI website.

characteristics as well as catches and payments should be reported by the country.” was moved to Recommendation 4.

Recommendation 4: **FiTI Reports should include for large-scale fisheries information on ownership (rights holder and vessel owner), vessel characteristics as well as annual payments and catches per species, including discarded and retained by-catch, on a per vessel basis. Any legally binding impediments to doing so for certain vessels should be resolved before commencing with FiTI.**

→ *There was consensus on the part of the recommendation that concerns information on a per vessel basis regarding vessel characteristics, authorizations and actual payments for large-scale fisheries.*

→ *There was no consensus on the recommendation to include information on catches on a per-vessel basis.*

→ *There was consensus that FiTI implementing countries should be requested to provide comprehensive data on by-catch, including discarded and retained by-catch, but a failure to do so would not result in non-compliance with the FiTI Standard if there was sufficient explanation given for the lack of data.*

Additional comments regarding catch data on a per-vessel basis:

- Disagreements emerged regarding the necessity and legal feasibility to report catch data on a per-vessel basis for large-scale fisheries due to several reasons:
 - *Commercial interests:* It was argued that data on catches disclosed on a per-vessel basis would represent commercially sensitive information, and could impact negatively on fishing companies, such as contributing to unfair competition and hostile takeovers. Others doubted whether catch data disclosed on an annual basis would be commercially sensitive information.
 - *Justification:* There were differing opinions on whether public disclosure of annual per-vessel catch data would be useful for the FiTI. One view was that effective fisheries management does not require public scrutiny of per vessel catch data, and there would be no added value to the FiTI of including this information. Another view was that such data should be in the public domain as it may reveal

instances of unreported or misreported catches, which otherwise would not be detected by public authorities. Proponents of the disclosure of annual per-vessel catch data also argued that this would be necessary for the credibility of FiTI Reports, as without access to this information it would be difficult to independently verify the accuracy of aggregated catch data.

- *Legal constraints:* It was argued that the requirement of disclosing catch data on a per-vessel basis will violate existing legal obligations and requirements for coastal states, including confidentiality requirements established through RFMOs and bi-lateral access agreements. It was further noted that, as commercially sensitive information, it would be unlawful for governments to disclose this information. However, there was doubt raised by some participants that there are legal barriers to states if they wanted to publish such information, and that it would be feasible for states to avail themselves of any legal constraints if they wanted to. It was further noted that in the case of the EU, disclosure of per-vessel catch data may be supported by freedom of information laws, including the obligations set out in the Aarhus Convention³.

➔ *As there was no consensus on this issue, the International FiTI Advisory Group agreed to establish a dedicated Taskforce on “Vessel-by-Vessel Reporting” to analyze obstacles for providing annual data on catches per vessel as part of the FiTI as well as to seek to provide a consensus-based recommendation.*

The following detailed composition has been agreed: 2x representatives from current pilot countries: Seychelles and Indonesia; 1x representative from the European Union; 1x representative from the Long Distance Advisory Council (LDAC); 1x representative from civil society: World Wide Fund For Nature.

The Taskforce will be operationally managed and overseen by the International FiTI Secretariat.

³ UNECE Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters.

Additional comments regarding retained by-catch and discards:

- It was agreed that it is desirable for FiTI reporting requirements to include data on by-catch, including both retained- and discarded by-catch, as the management of by-catch is essential to responsible management of fisheries. However, it was recognized that data on by-catch may not be available for all fisheries, and it may not be mandatory for vessels to report on by-catch in some cases.

Recommendation 5: **Within the reporting category “Catches” for large-scale fisheries, FiTI Reports should include information on a per-vessel basis on the amount of catch landed locally, including by-catch, and what amounts are transshipped in port or transshipped at sea.**

→ *This recommendation was approved by consensus, pending the agreement on whether data should be provided on a per-vessel basis. If not, the data may be aggregated in a way that will not permit the identification of a vessel.*

Additional remarks:

- The term “within the country’s EEZ (or territorial waters)” was deleted from the initial recommendation (dated 7 June 2016) so that the recommendation also covers high-seas and international waters.

Recommendation 6: ***The recommendation on approaches to non-reporting catch data by vessels will be finalized by the International Advisory Group.***

→ *Discussions on the various options for this recommendation were postponed, referring to the decision on the issue of per-vessel reporting.*

Recommendation 7: **Mandatory reporting elements for large-scale fisheries will be applicable to vessels provided with any type of fishing licenses, including recreational as well as non-commercial scientific or research licenses.**

→ *This recommendation was approved by consensus.*

Additional remarks:

- It was also agreed that this applies only to countries in which such license schemes exist. If this does not apply, countries are asked to note this accordingly in the reporting of Tenure Arrangements.

Recommendation 8: **The FiTI should include the name of fishing agents paid by vessel owners to secure fishing licenses, where applicable. FiTI Reports should indicate for each vessel if this information is not applicable due to vessel owners not using a fishing agent.**

→ *This recommendation was approved by consensus.*

Additional remarks:

- The role of fishing agents should be described in Tenure Arrangements, including any legal obligations for vessel owners in using fishing agents.

Recommendation 9: **The FiTI should collate information on known offences by fishing vessels, as well as information on penalties and fines that have been administered by the relevant authority or court. FiTI Reports will only include resolved cases, and not information on on-going cases. However, this information will be presented in the Contextual Information part of FiTI Reports and not necessarily on a per vessel basis.**

→ *This recommendation was approved by consensus. Therefore, information on known offences, penalties and fines will be covered solely in the contextual information.*

Recommendation 10: **Information for large-scale fisheries (as based on the tables shown in Annex I) should be provided every 12 months.**

→ *This recommendation was approved by consensus.*

Additional remarks:

- It was discussed on whether there should be a fixed reporting cycle e.g. per calendar year, as this may be the general reporting period for countries anyway. However, it was noted that this might impose unreasonable administrative burden to implementing countries as well as to the International Secretariat and the (envisioned) Regional Secretariats. It was agreed that this aspect should be reviewed as part of the discussions regarding a Regional Secretariat approach.

RECOMMENDATIONS on SMALL-SCALE FISHERIES⁴

Previous International Advisory Group meetings have emphasized the importance of including small-scale fisheries in the FiTI. It has been agreed that the level of reporting on small-scale fisheries should reflect the practical difficulties facing coastal states in collating information on this sector, and that existing information held by coastal states might be dated or based on estimates only.

Mr. BIERMANN clarified that every country will adopt the structure of reporting on small-scale fisheries according to its own sectoral characteristics and requirements.

He pointed out that this section of the FiTI Report would mostly contain **quantitative information**.

Recommendation 11: FiTI Transparency Elements for the small-scale fisheries sector should provide information broken down for vessel types, gear types and for designated fisheries based on target species.

→ *This recommendation was approved by consensus.*

Additional remarks:

- There was discussion to exclude subsistence fisheries from the FiTI Reports. One concern was that by making subsistence fisheries transparent, the risk of taxation is rising for those who already have barely enough to live. However, it was argued that the goal of the FiTI Report is to capture the whole range of contributions from the fisheries sector, and to omit data on subsistence fisheries may obscure their contribution to food

⁴ For detailed background to the recommendations, please refer to the Preparation Document, available at the FiTI website.

security and local economies. Subsistence fisheries will therefore be included in the FiTI.

Recommendation 12: Information for small-scale fisheries (as based on the tables shown in Annex 2) should be provided every 12 months.

→ *This recommendation was approved by consensus.*

Additional remarks:

- It was argued that this frequency of reporting would require the provision of capacity-building in some countries as data is often only updated every five years (if at all). It was however agreed that even estimates based on past surveys would bring additional value. It was acknowledged that the same data source may be used in annual FiTI Reports, and this would be acceptable if the National Multi-Stakeholder Group agreed that this was the best available information.

RECOMMENDATIONS on CONTEXTUAL INFORMATION⁵

The International Advisory Group discussed that FiTI Reports should include Contextual Information. This is important as the quantitative information specified on the large-scale sector and small-scale sector may not be sufficient to understand the management of fisheries. Moreover, there are several important aspects of fisheries governance that are often lacking transparency.

Contextual information could cover I) Post-harvest and trade data, II) Fish stock assessments, III) Fisheries management activities, IV) Labor standards, V) Subsidies, and VI) Development aid.

Mr. BIERMANN clarified that this section of the FiTI Report would contain **largely qualitative information**. It was further stated that this information could be compiled by an FiTI Report Administrator, with assistance from the National Multi-Stakeholder Group where needed. Governments are not expected to compile this information themselves.

⁵ For detailed background to the recommendations, please refer to the Preparation Document, available at the FiTI website.

Recommendation 13: The FiTI should provide mandatory Contextual Information on six categories [post-harvest and trade data, fish stock assessments, fisheries management activities, labor standards, subsidies, and development aid]. Such information will be primarily provided in a narrative form.

→ This recommendation was approved by consensus.

Additional remarks:

- FiTI Reports should include the status of compliance of countries with regards to the reporting requirements of the RFMOs of which they are a member.
- It was discussed whether the definition of “development aid” should also include projects by civil society organizations. This aspect requires further discussions.
- One view was that over time FiTI should consider providing information on subsidies on a per-vessel basis.

Recommendation 14: Contextual Information should be provided every 24 months.

→ This recommendation was approved by consensus.

Additional remarks:

- One comment was that some elements of the Contextual Information should be updated whenever available (for instance stock assessments).

RECOMMENDATIONS on BASIC TRANSPARENCY REQUIREMENTS⁶

Mr. EIGEN postponed the discussions on the recommendations on basic transparency requirements, as the discussions on the mandatory reporting elements took longer than anticipated. The recommendations will be discussed at the 5th International Advisory Group meeting.

⁶ For detailed background to the recommendations, please refer to the Preparation Document, available at the FiTI website.

THE WAY FORWARD AND NEXT STEPS

Mr. **Sven BIERMANN** concluded the meeting by outlining the next steps after the meeting.

Mr. BIERMANN outlined that until the end of the Conceptual Phase (currently envisioned for March/April 2017, there would be a maximum of two additional International Advisory Group meetings. Open questions remaining for these two meetings refer to how to deal with reporting of catches on a per-vessel basis and how beneficial ownership transparency should be covered. Further, these meetings will focus primarily on the reporting process (i.e. data collection, verification and publication) and governance (e.g. transition of Advisory Group to International Multi-Stakeholder Board).

Mr. BIERMANN asked the participants to submit ideas regarding where **5th Advisory Group meeting (which is envisioned to take place around October 2016)** could take place.

Mr. HANGGONO offered that **Indonesia would host the 2nd International Conference of the FiTI** in 2017 in Bali. The conference will mark the transition from the conceptual to the implementation phase of the FiTI. Mr. EIGEN thanked Mr. HANGGONO and the Government of Indonesia for this generous offer. The proposal of Indonesia was welcomed and unequivocally accepted by all participants of the International Advisory Group meeting. The International FiTI Secretariat will work closely with the Government of Indonesia to determine the exact date for this conference.

APPENDIX I: List of Participants

Organization (in alphabetical order)⁷	Name
African Union-Interafrican Bureau for Animal Resources (AU-IBAR)	Mr. Simplicie NOUALA
Association of Russian Ship-owners in West Africa	Mr. Alexander BIRYUKOV
Bread for the World	Mr. Francisco MARI
Causa Natura	Ms. Ana Harumi Hayashida CARRILLO
Commonwealth Human Ecology Council	Mr. Nicholas WATTS
Confederación Española de Pesca (Cepesca)	Mr. Juan Pablo RODRÍGUEZ-SAHAGUN
Confédération Africaine des Organisations Professionnelles de Pêche Artisanale (CAOPA)	Mr. Gaoussou GUEYE
Confédération Africaine des Organisations Professionnelles de Pêche Artisanale (CAOPA)	Mr. Sid'Ahmed ABEID
Embassy of the Republic of Guinea in Madrid	Mr. Frederic KOLIE
Environmental Justice Foundation (EJF)	Mr. Alberto MARTÍN
European Commission – Directorate General for Maritime Affairs and Fisheries	Mr. Kristofer DU RIETZ
Food and Agriculture Organization of the UN (FAO)	Ms. Victoria CHOMO
Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)	Ms. Mechthild KRONEN

⁷ Participants may not necessarily reflect the official opinion of their organization and may serve in their personal capacity. Furthermore, not all participants of this meeting are already members of the International Advisory Group.

Government of Costa Rica, Mission to the WTO in Geneva	Mr. Alvaro CEDENO MOLINARI
Greenpeace	Mr. Sebastián LOSADA
Long Distance Advisory Council (LDAC)	Mr. Alexandre RODRÍGUEZ
Mauritanie 2000	Ms. Nedwa NECH
Ministry for Agriculture, Food and Environment, Spain	Mr. Andrés HERMIDA
Ministry for Agriculture, Food and Environment, Spain	Mr. Rafael CENTENERA ULECIA
Ministry of Economy and Finance, Islamic Republic of Mauritania	Mr. Abass SYLLA
Ministry of Economy and Finance, Islamic Republic of Mauritania	Mr. Mohamed Salem NANY
Ministry of Fisheries and Maritime Economy, Islamic Republic of Mauritania	Mr. Almamy Samboly BÂ
Ministry of Fisheries and Maritime Economy, Islamic Republic of Mauritania	Mr. Mohamed Salem LOULY
Ministry of Fisheries, Aquaculture and Maritime Economy, Republic of Guinea	H.E. André LOUA
Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, Republic of Indonesia	Mr. Aryo HANGGONO
Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, Republic of Indonesia	Ms. Iga Ayu Sthiti Saraswati KANIA
Ministry of Sea, Inland and Fisheries, Republic of Mozambique	Mr. Narci Nuro DE PREMEGI
Ministry of Sea, Inland and Fisheries, Republic of Mozambique	Mr. Erudito Boavida MALATE

Oceana	Ms. María José CORNAX
Organización de Productores Asociados de Grandes Atuneros Congeladores (OPAGAC)	Mr. Miguel HERRERA
Organización de Productores Asociados de Grandes Atuneros Congeladores (OPAGAC)	Mr. Julio MORÓN
Partenariat Régional pour la Conservation de la zone Côtière et Marine en Afrique de l'Ouest	Mr. Jean Auguste Barthélémy BATIENO
Réseau des Journalistes pour une Pêche Responsable et durable en Afrique de l'Ouest (REJOPRAO)	Mr. Inoussa MAIGA
Seychelles Fisheries Authority, Seychelles	Mr. Philippe MICHAUD
Swedish Agency for Marine and Water Management	Ms. Gunilla TEGELSKÄR GREIG
Sustainable Fisheries Partnership	Mr. Andrew DONALDSON
The Varda Group	Mr. Rémi PARMENTIER
The Varda Group	Ms. Inés DE AGUEDA
The World Bank	Mr. Xavier VINCENT
World Wide Fund for Nature (WWF)	Mr. Alfred SCHUMM
Independent Expert (former FAO)	Mr. Rolf WILLMANN



HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform	Mr. Peter EIGEN
HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform	Mr. Sven BIERMANN
HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform	Ms. Andréa DURIGHELLO
HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform	Mr. Sebastian WEGNER
Advisor to HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform	Mr. André STANDING

DRAFT

APPENDIX II: Initial agenda of the meeting⁸

The tea breaks and lunch were kindly organized by the Foundation Oceana.

08:30 – 09:00 *Arrival of participants*

09:00 – 09:45 **Opening remarks and Welcome**

Welcome by *Mr. Andrés HERMIDA*, Secretary General of Fisheries of the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Environment of Spain

Opening remarks by *Mr. Peter EIGEN*, Co-founder of the HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform, Chair of the International Advisory Group of the FiTI

Remarks by *Mr. Abass SYLLA*, Director General, Ministry of Economy and Finance, Islamic Republic of Mauritania

Remarks by *Mr. Álvaro Cedeño MOLINARI*, Ambassador of Costa Rica at the World Trade Organization, Switzerland

Key note by *H.E. André LOUA*, Minister of Fisheries, Aquaculture and Maritime Economy of the Republic of Guinea

09:45 – 10:00 **Update on current status of the FiTI**

Mr. Sven BIERMANN, Director of the FiTI

10:00 – 10:30 **Report from implementing countries**

Mauritania, Seychelles, Indonesia

10:30 – 10:45 *Coffee & Tea break*

⁸ The agenda was adjusted on an ad-hoc basis during the meeting to reflect the need for longer discussion times regarding the recommendations on mandatory reporting elements for tenure arrangements, large-scale- and small-scale fisheries.

10:45 – 13:00 Recommendations on mandatory reporting elements for tenure arrangements, large-scale- and small-scale fisheries

Group discussion

For more information, please refer to accompanying document “Preparatory Information” (Chapter 1 – A, B, C).

13:00 – 14:00 Lunch

14:00 – 15:00 Recommendations on contextual information

Group discussion

For more information, please refer to accompanying document “Preparatory Information” (Chapter 1 – D).

15:00 – 15:30 Recommendations on basic transparency requirements

Group discussion

For more information, please refer to accompanying document “Preparatory Information” (Chapter 2).

15:30 – 15:45 Coffee & Tea break

15:45 – 16:15 Considerations on the FiTI Reporting process

Group discussion

For more information, please refer to accompanying document “Preparatory Information” (Chapter 3).

16:15 – 16:45 Next steps towards the 2nd International Conference of the FiTI

Mr. Sven Biermann, Director of the FiTI

16.45 – 17:00 Wrap-up, Next Steps and Farewell

Mr. Peter Eigen, Co-founder of the HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform, Chair of the International Advisory Group of the FiTI