8 January 2019

Meeting between ICES, Advisory Councils and other Observers (MIACO)

17 January (1pm) –18 January (1 pm) 2019 Chair: Mark Dickey-Collas Draft Agenda (annotated)

- 1) Welcome and opening of the meeting.
- 2) Adoption of agenda (Doc 02).

Suggested dates for MIACO 2020 – 16-17 January 2020.

3) Review

a) Review of ICES Advisory services in 2018 (Doc 03).

An overview of the advice process and the advice provided in 2018 is given in document 03.

MIACO is invited to review the advisory process in 2018 and to discuss via round table any issues and concerns arose since the 2018 MIACO meeting.

Also review progress on action points from MIACO 2018 (annex 1).

b) Skills shortages.

ICES has highlighted that the research and advice community lack expertise in some key areas, including mixed fisheries, management strategy evaluation, stakeholder engagement and combining qualitative and quantitative information. In addition, expertise is sometimes lacking to address certain special requests. ICES is exploring mechanisms to resolve these shortages.

MIACO will be invited to comment on this list and provide their experience of skills shortages as well as their views on the key areas where expertise will be required in the coming years.

4) Quality assurance and consistency.

a) Quality assurance (Doc 4a)

Errors in ICES advice were discussed at previous MIACO meeting. All Clients acknowledged that errors might appear but expect that they would be minimized. Quality check of data was also discussed previously and Clients expressed willingness to cooperate with ICES to ensure that ICES has access to all relevant data.

2 | MIACO January 2019

ICES will present initiatives taken within ICES to quality assure ICES advisory products. MIACO is invited to comment on the initiatives taken by ICES and to discuss possible needs for further initiatives.

b) Greater consistency in outcome (Doc 4d)

ICES has developed a comprehensive framework for assessing the state of fish stocks and their exploitation and for providing advice on fishing opportunities, that conforms to international best practice (FAO guidelines).

The advantage of these frameworks is consistency in process maybe not consistency in outcome. This is particularly true in the case of large biases or uncertainties in the assessment. Stability in advice has been highlighted as a major concern by clients and stakeholders.

MIACO is invited to discuss future approaches to improving the stability in the advice.

c) ICES Code of Conduct (Doc 4c)

ICES Council approved a Code of Conduct for experts contributing to ICES science and advice to maintain scientific independence, integrity and impartiality. The ICES Code of Conduct provides guidance on identifying and handling actual, potential or perceived Conflicts of Interest and is presented for information.

The role of independent review of stock assessment methods and special requests will also be highlighted.

MIACO is invited to comment.

5) Layers of advice

As recently highlighted by Ernesto Penas-Lado, the complexity and layering of the evidence based required to inform fisheries and marine environmental management is continuing to increase. ICES needs to adapt to this layering and ensure that its advice is credible throughout the layers, is broad enough to remain relevant and legitimate across multiple management objectives.

There are a number of initiatives:

a) Mixed fisheries advice (Doc 5a)

As in other regions of the world, there are increasing requests for decision makers to compare the consequences of choices catches on one stock across other fish stocks and bycatch in mixed fisheries. ICES is incrementally developing tools and approaches to provide this information but perhaps not rapidly enough to consider the management challenges of spatial closures, temporal shifts and changes in selectivity.

The Celtic Seas Fisheries Overview is provided to show the current approach to mixed fisheries advice (see page 22).

Meeting participants will be asked to share with ICES any experiences or concerns with mixed fisheries advice.

b) Fisheries and Ecosystem Overviews (Doc 5b)

To encompass the need to layer ICES advice, fisheries and ecosystem overviews have been developed. This also always movement towards providing advice within the context of the ecosystem approach to be documented.

Fisheries overviews have been published for the Baltic Sea, Celtic Seas and the Greater North Sea ecoregions.

http://www.ices.dk/community/advisory-process/Pages/fisheries-overviews.aspx

Ecosystem overviews have been published for Barents Sea, Bay of Biscay and Iberian Coast, Celtic Seas, Greater North Sea, Baltic Sea, Icelandic waters, Norwegian Sea.

http://www.ices.dk/community/advisory-process/Pages/Ecosystem-overviews.aspx

ICES is now aiming at publishing in 2019 fisheries overviews for the Norwegian & Barents Seas and the Bay of Biscay and Iberian waters and ecosystem overviews for the Oceanic northeast Atlantic and the Azores ecoregions.

ICES is interested in feedback on the overviews and MIACO is invited to review the overviews and comment on possible improvements.

c) Frameworks for ecosystem advice (Doc 5c)

ICES has developed a comprehensive framework for assessing the state of fish but does not have a similar framework for providing ecosystem advice.

To ensure that ICES ecosystem advice is consistent with international agreed objectives and developed in a transparent process ICES is currently developing a set of frameworks for ecosystem advice. As part of this work ICES is planning a dialogue meeting for late 2020.

ICES will give a short presentation of the work to develop the frameworks.

d) Multidisciplinary nature of special requests

Many of the special requests answered in recent years have required an increased diversity of expertise; e.g. ecology, valuation, spatial mapping, stakeholder facilitation. Examples of this type of advice will be presented to MIACO.

6) Operational advice

a) ICES MSY approach for category 1 and 2 stocks below Blim. (Doc 6a)

In 2018, ICES advised zero catch for a number of stocks that were estimated to be below Blim. ICES has considered this issue further in line with international practice and is updating its approach to provide catch advice for these stocks.

4 | MIACO January 2019

ICES will give a short presentation of the approach and invite MIACO to discuss the approach applied by ICES.

b) Special workshops in 2019. (Doc 6d)

There have been challenges with the provision of fishing opportunities advice for mackerel in the Atlantic and for mixed fisheries advice in the Baltic Sea. ICES has agreed to hold two scoping workshops on the science and advice needs for these two issues in 2019.

- Workshop on the Ecosystem Based Management of the Baltic Sea (WKBALTIC), location and date to be determined
- Workshop on a Research Roadmap for Mackerel (WKRRMAC), Bremerhaven, 7-9 May 2019

MIACO is invited to review and comment on the workshops. MIACO is also asked to publicise and send representatives to the workshops.

7) Looking to the future

To remain fit for purpose, the advice and evidence for decision making from ICES needs to adapt to the changing needs of managers and policy developers across its client governments and commissions. ICES has released the new strategic plan, which incorporates a new science plan. These will be described to MIACO.

In 2019, ICES will also develop a new advice plan, which will be in line with the two other plans.

a) ICES strategic plan

The strategic plan will be presented to MIACO during the evening reception. It will be circulated at the reception.

MIACO will be asked for informal comment during the evening.

b) ICES science plan

The science plan will be presented by the Chair of SCICOM and circulated during MIACO.

MIACO will asked for comment.

c) Single stock advice

The current format of the single stock advice sheets was introduced in 2015. ICES has initiated a work to create an interactive web-based platform for presenting advice.

https://ices-tools-dev.github.io/VISA_tool/hke.27.3a46-8abd.html https://ices-tools-dev.github.io/VISA_tool/bli.27.5b67.html https://ices-tools-dev.github.io/VISA_tool/her.27.25-2932.html https://ices-tools-dev.github.io/VISA_tool/nep.fu.11.html

MIACO is invited to review the initial web pages and comment.

8) ICES Advisory Work-plan 2019.

The meeting will be updated with information on the Work-plan for ICES advice and relevant science initiatives in 2019. Clients are invited to comment on the plan including the timing for release of recurrent advice.

9) Any other business- pre notification required

The Fisheries Secretariat (FishSec)

Is any discussion on a "traffic-light" indicator for population and age structure as related to the Marine Strategy Framework directive, or for Recruitment. Or any other way of making this information more available to managers and stakeholders?

The LDAC

What is the state of play and the hope for the ICES working group on economics (WGECON http://www.ices.dk/community/groups/Pages/WGECON.aspx)?

ICES was not notified of any other issues.

Suggested timetable

17 January

- 13:00 Welcome, agenda, review (1-3)
- 14:30 Quality Assurance (4)
- 15:30 Coffee
- 16:00 Layers of advice (5)
- 18:00 Reception with presentation of ICES strategic plan (7)

18 January

- 09:30 Operational advice (6)
- 10:45 Coffee
- 11:15 Looking into the future (7)
- 12:15 Advisory work plan (8)
- 12:40 AOB
- 13:00 Close

6 | MIACO January 2019

Annex 1. Action points from MIACO 2018

- Further development on communication and understanding of advice was concluded needed. ICES referred to a currently ongoing process under a special request from the EC on visual representation of advice.
 DONE and included in MIACO 2019 agenda item 7c
- Critical control points in the assessment process need to be identified and made clear. Guidelines on how this is being done should be provided as published Technical Guidelines.
 DEVELOPMENT OF TAF (transparent assessment framework) and quality assurance MIACO agenda item 4a.
- Training of new scientists in fisheries modelling needs to be a priority and ICES should convey this to Member Countries via ICES Council.
 DONE and 2 hours at Council were spent on skills shortages, MIACO 2019 agenda item 3b
- Create a Stakeholder/observer forum
 DONE http://community.ices.dk/Advice/advice activities/default.aspx but not greatly used.